```
Mon 1/4/2010 9:54:36 PM
Sent:
Subject: Re: Fw: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
Sure, I'll give you a call, lets say at 5 after to give you time to get
clear of your other meeting?
Talk to you tomorrow,
--Sarah
North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
> That works for me. If you are in Seattle then yes, it is 11 - 12 your
> time. Will you call me?
> Phillip North
> Environmental Protection Agency
> Kenai River Center
> 514 Funny River Road
> Soldotna, Alaska 99669
> (907) 714-2483
> fax 260-5992
> north.phil@epa.gov
> "To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."
>
>
  From:
             Sarah Gaichas <Sarah Gaichas @noaa.gov>
>
  To:
           Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
>
  Date:
            01/04/2010 12:28 PM
  Subject: Re: Fw: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>
>
>
> Wednesday works fine for me. Want to talk between 10-11 (your time,
> which I think is between 11 and noon my time)?
> --S
> North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
>> I will be out of the office all day tomorrow. How about Wednesday? I
>> am free except 9:30 - 10 and 11 - 12.
>>
>> Thanks
>>
>> Phillip North
>> Environmental Protection Agency
>> Kenai River Center
>> 514 Funny River Road
>> Soldotna, Alaska 99669
```

Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA[]

Sarah Gaichas

To:

From:

```
>> (907) 714-2483
>> fax 260-5992
>> north.phil@epa.gov
>> "To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."
>>
>>
>>
>>
>
>> From:
              Sarah Gaichas <Sarah.Gaichas@noaa.gov>
>>
>
>
>
>
>> To:
            Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
>>
>
>
>
>
             01/04/2010 11:23 AM
>>
    Date:
>
>
>
>> Subject: Re: Fw: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>>
>
>
>
>
>>
>>
>>
>> Hi Phil,
>> I'm happy to try and help, but would tomorrow work? I'm teleworking
>> today, dont have access to all of my files, and have a review
>>
> deadline.
>> Since this sounds like more of a Bering Sea issue and I am most
>>
> familiar
>> with the GOA, it would be good to try to answer you with some Bering
> Sea
>> information in front of me.... thats all at the office.
>> Would around 10 am tomorrow work? Or let me know a time that works
```

```
>> better. My number is 206 526 4554.
>>
>> Thanks,
>> --Sarah
>>
>> North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
>>
>>
>>> Hi Sarah,
>>> Can you help me out? If you send a phone number I'll call and
> explain
>>> my effort. Anything you can offer would be helpful.
>>> Thanks
>>> Phil
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>> Phillip North
>>> Environmental Protection Agency
>>> Kenai River Center
>>> 514 Funny River Road
>>> Soldotna, Alaska 99669
>>> (907) 714-2483
>>> fax 260-5992
>>> north.phil@epa.gov
>>> "To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>
>>> From:
              "Daniel Schindler" <deschind@u.washington.edu>
>>>
>>>
>>
>>
>>
>>> To:
             <sarah.gaichas@noaa.gov>
>>>
>>>
>>
>>
>>
             Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
>>> Cc:
>>>
>>>
>>
>>
>>
>>> Date: 12/31/2009 12:12 PM
```

>>>

```
>>>
>>
>>
>>> Subject: Fw: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>>>
>>>
>>
>>
>>
>>> Hi Sarah,
>>> I intended for you to receive this message but mis-typed your email.
>>>
>>>
>>> ----- Original Message -----
>>> From: "Daniel Schindler" <deschind@u.washington.edu>
>>> To: <wgpearcy@coas.oregonstate.edu>; <North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov>
>>> Cc: "Kerim Aydin" <Kerim.Aydin@noaa.gov>; <sarah.gachias@noaa.gov>
>>> Sent: Thursday, December 31, 2009 1:07 PM
>>> Subject: Re: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> Hi Phil.
>>>> I suspect that at the scale of fish biomass in the North Pacific, or
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> even
>>>
>>>
>>>> Bering and Gulf of AK, that this number will end up being tiny. The
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> person
>>>
>>>
>>>> to get in touch with to put your estimate in perspective is Kerim
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> Aydin at
>>>
>>>
>>>> the Alaska Fisheries Science Center. His group has developed a bunch
>>>>
>>>>
```

```
>>>>
>>> of
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> Ecosim models for these ecosystems so they should be able to tell
>>>>
> you
>>>>
>>> who
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> the main predators for salmon smolts are, and how much of their
>>>>
> diets
>>>>
>>> are
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>> smolts. Sarah Gachias also works with this group and certainly has
>>>>
>> the
>>
>>
>>>> answer as well.
>>>> Cheers and good luck - all data to show that the Pebble Mine is an
>>> environmental (and social) mistake are needed!
>>>> Daniel
>>>>
>>>>
>>> ----- Original Message -----
>>>> From: <North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov>
>>>> To: <wgpearcy@coas.oregonstate.edu>; <deschind@u.washington.edu>
>>> Sent: Thursday, December 31, 2009 9:34 AM
>>> Subject: Fw: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Bill and Daniel,
>>>> As you can see in the message string below Bob Naiman gave me your
>>>> names. I am trying to describe the likely consequences of various
>>>> scenarios of impact should the Pebble Mine be developed in the
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> Bristol
>>>
>>>
```

```
>>>
>>>> Bay watershed. As described below, based on ADFG data and
>>>>
>>>>
>>> assumptions I
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> have estimated that the Nushagak and Kvichak river systems produced
>>>> about 1.6 billion smolts from the 2008 salmon run. About 1.57
>>>>
>>>>
>>> billion
>>>
>>>
>>>> of these fish will not return and so are forage for something in
>>>>
> the
>>>> North Pacific and Bering Sea. But I have no sense of the
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> significance
>>>
>>>
>>>> of that number of fish in the ocean ecosystem. I am trying to
>>>>
>> answer
>>
>>
>>>> the question "If there was a substantial loss from the
> out-migration
>>>>
>>> of
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> Nushagak and Kvichak salmon what would be the effect on the North
>>>> Pacific and Bering Sea ecosystem(s)?"
>>>> My background is in fresh water systems. Can you direct me to any
>>>> literature that might help answer the question or can you help me
>>>>
>>>>
>>> answer
>>>
>>>
```

```
>>>
>>>> this question?
>>>>
>>>> Phil
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Phillip North
>>>> Environmental Protection Agency
>>>> Kenai River Center
>>>> 514 Funny River Road
>>>> Soldotna, Alaska 99669
>>>> (907) 714-2483
>>>> fax 260-5992
>>>> north.phil@epa.gov
>>>> "To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."
>>>> ----- Forwarded by Phil North/R10/USEPA/US on 12/31/2009 08:18 AM
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> -----
>>>
>>>
>>>> From:
               "Robert J. Naiman" <naiman@uw.edu>
>>>>
              Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
>>>> To:
>>>>
               12/31/2009 06:20 AM
>>>> Date:
>>>>
>>>> Subject: Re: Bristol Bay salmon role in North Pacific
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Phil,
>>>>
>>>> You might try contacting Bill Pearcy (Oregon State University;
>>>> <wgpearcy@coas.oregonstate.edu>) or Daniel Schindler (UW;
>>>> <deschind@u.washington.edu>). If they cannot help then I suspect
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>> that
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> they will know someone who can.
>>>> I hope your project goes well as there is a lot riding on the
>>>> development of the mine.
>>>>
>>>> Cheers, Bob
```

```
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Robert J. Naiman
>>>> Professor and UNESCO Chair in Sustainable Rivers
>>>> School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences
>>>> University of Washington - 355020
>>>> Seattle, WA 98195-5020 USA
>>>> Phone (206) 685-2025
>>>> Fax: (206) 685-7471
>>>>
>>>> FOR DELIVERIES AND EXPRESS MAIL:
>>>> UW-Fishery Sciences Building
>>>> 1122 N.E. Boat Street
>>>> Seattle, WA 98105
>>>> <<<<<<<
>>>>
>>>> On Wed, 30 Dec 2009 North.Phil@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Hello Dr. Naiman,
>>>> One of my duties is the review of environmental impacts of the
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> Pebble
>>>
>>>
>>>> Mine in the Bristol Bay watershed. In my attempt to determine
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> likely
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> outcomes of mine development I have tried to project the
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> consequences
>>>
>>>
>>>> of
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> various levels of upset at the mine, in various time frames. In
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> doing
>>>
```

```
>>>
>>>
>>>> so I estimated the number of smolts produced by the Nushagak and
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>> Kvichak
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> Rivers. I am not aware of any monitoring of smolts so I employed
>>>> assumptions and estimates used by ADFG to manage the fishery. I
>>>>> projected that, based on 2008 escapement estimates (28 million)
>>>>>
> and
>>>> smolt survival assumptions (10%), these two watersheds produced
> 1.6
>>>> billion smolts.
>>>>> This seems like a big number. But now I am trying to figure out
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> what
>>>
>>>
>>>>> this number means to the North Pacific ecosystem (including the
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>> Bering
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> Sea). I don't know how this number of fish relates to the overall
>>>> population of "forage fish". In turn I don't know the
>>>>>
> consequences
>
>>>>>
>>> of
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>> a
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>> reduction of this number of fish migrating to food webs in the
>>>>>
>>>>>
>> North
```

```
>>
>>
>>>> Pacific.
>>>>> Can you recommend anyone I might contact who has this expertise?
>>>> Phil
>>>>>
>>>>> Phillip North
>>>> Environmental Protection Agency
>>>>> Kenai River Center
>>>> 514 Funny River Road
>>>> Soldotna, Alaska 99669
>>>> (907) 714-2483
>>>> fax 260-5992
>>>> north.phil@epa.gov
>>>> "To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>
>>>
>>>
>>
>>
>>
>>
>
>
```